

CATHOLIC UMBRELLA POOL II
11 to 15 Passenger Van, Bus and Shuttle Use Policy

Effective July 1, 2003, Catholic Umbrella Pool II adopted the following policies governing the use of 11 to 15 passenger vans (whether owned, leased, or borrowed).

1. The use of non-owned (borrowed) or short-term leased 11 to 15 passenger vans to transport children or adults is prohibited beginning July 1, 2003.
2. **The use of 11 to 15 passenger vans to transport children or adults is totally prohibited beginning July 1, 2004.** Beginning July 1, 2004, 11 to 15 passenger vans may be used for cargo hauling **only if** all but the two front seats are removed.
3. Although **not recommended**, to allow for a transition to other types of vehicles, organizations may continue to use owned or long-term leased 11 to 15 passenger vans to transport children or adults until July 1, 2004 (unless prohibited by state law). However, 11 to 15 passenger vans cannot be purchased or leased after July 1, 2003 for the intent of transporting children or adults.
4. 11-15 passenger vans can be replaced with either a school bus or a Multifunction School Activity Bus (MFSAB). A MFSAB is a vehicle which complies with the Federal Motor Vehicle Safety Standards (FMVSS) applicable to school buses for crash survivability and mirrors.
5. If a MFSAB is used for the transportation of children, these vehicles **must** meet FMVSS 111; FMVSS 220; FMVSS 221; and FMVSS 222 (see below). If purchasing a MFSAB to transport children, it is important to confirm with the seller that the vehicle meets all four FMVSS. There are vehicles that visually appear to be conforming, but are not.
6. When acquiring a bus or shuttle to transport adults, the four FMVSS should also be followed. However, CUP II may approve adult transportation for a nonconforming bus or shuttle that meets at least two of the FMVSS's in limited circumstances. Requests for exceptions should be submitted to Catholic Mutual.
7. Although MFSAB's are preferred, mini-vans may continue to be used to transport children or adults. A mini-van is defined as a passenger vehicle **designed** to transport no more than **8** total occupants.

Below are the four FMVSS referred to in the above policy. Additional information on how to determine if a bus or shuttle meets FMVSS standards can be obtained from Catholic Mutual's Risk Management Department at (800) 228-6108.

FMVSS 111 – Fulfills the safety requirement for the rear-view and cross-view visibility.

FMVSS 220 – Establishes requirements for the school bus body structure in rollover accidents.

FMVSS 221 – Regulates the strength of body panel joints in school buses.

FMVSS 222 – Establishes occupant protection requirements for school bus passenger seating and barriers.

Important Note: *Vans, Buses and Shuttle Buses capable of transporting 16 plus passengers must also comply with the above FMVSS. As outlined in number six of the above policy, exceptions can be made if the vehicle is used solely for the transport of adults.*

CATHOLIC MUTUAL'S 11 TO 15 PASSENGER VAN USE POLICY

Since 1999, the National Transportation Safety Board has issued a safety recommendation regarding the use of these vans and the National Highway Transportation Safety Administration has issued two safety advisories regarding the use of 11 to 15 passenger vans. Additionally, many states are issuing new transportation rules and regulations regarding the use of these vans.

Why are 1 to 15 passenger vans so dangerous? The experts say for many reasons, including the following:

- They are designed to carry cargo, **not people**, and so they do not comply with many of the basic safety requirements that apply to passenger cars or the stricter federal requirements that apply to school buses. For example, 11 to 15 passenger vans have fewer emergency exits (the back door is blocked by the back seat in many vans).
- They become top-heavy and prone to rollovers when fully loaded or occupied.
- Most drivers do not have a commercial driver's license and have received no formal training on the use of such vehicles.
- The side windows of most 11 to 15 passenger vans are made of tempered, not laminated, glass. Tempered glass is much cheaper and since 11 to 15 passenger vans were designed to carry cargo rather than people, the vehicle manufacturers have tended to use tempered glass for side windows. The problem with tempered glass is that it is far less likely to keep occupants from being ejected in an accident than laminated glass, which contains a middle layer of plastic.
- The risk of rollover increases sharply when drivers make sudden maneuvers. This risk is quite common, since there are many conditions that may cause a driver to swerve suddenly, including something falling off a truck in front of the van, a person or animal darting out onto the street, or a tire blowout.

Many of the 11 to 15 passenger van accidents cited by the media and others involve children. Recent safety recommendations, advisories, rules, and regulations generally apply to the use of these vans to transport children. But the transportation of adults in 11 to 15 passenger vans is also potentially dangerous. While we certainly want to protect children from an inherent danger, we should also protect the adults from potential danger.



National Transportation Safety Board

Washington, D.C. 20594

Safety Recommendation

Date: July 6, 1999

In reply refer to: H-99-22 through -24

See Distribution

In 1999, the National Transportation Safety Board initiated a special investigation as a result of its findings from four accidents in 1998 and 1999 involving "nonconforming buses," that is, vehicles for student transportation that meet the Federal definition of a bus¹ but not the Federal occupant crash protection standards of school buses.² In the subject accidents, summarized below, 9 people were killed, and 36 were injured.

On March 25, 1998, in Sweetwater, Florida, a 15-passenger van hired by parents to take children to and from school collided with a transit bus. Three children were ejected and sustained head injuries. On March 26, 1998, in Lenoir City, Tennessee, a 25-passenger specialty bus³ taking children from a school-related activity collided with a truck tractor semitrailer. Two people, one of whom was ejected, were fatally injured. On December 8, 1998, in East Dublin, Georgia, a 15-passenger van transporting children to a Head Start program collided with a pickup truck. One child was ejected and fatally injured. On February 16, 1999, in Bennettsville, South Carolina, a 15-passenger van transporting children home from an after-school church program was struck by a tow truck. Three children were ejected, and a total of six children were fatally injured.

The nonconforming buses involved in these accidents did not and were not required to meet Federal school bus occupant crash protection standards, which require that all school buses transporting children to and from school or school-related activities have roof rollover protection, energy-absorbing seats, and greater body joint strength than most other types of vehicles. Enactment of these Federal standards in the 1970s stemmed, in large part, from safety recommendations issued to the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) by the Safety Board as a result of its investigation of a number of catastrophic school bus accidents. In these tragic cases, many children were killed or severely injured when the buses structurally collapsed or suffered joint failure during the accident sequences.

¹ FMVSS (CFR 571.3) defines *bus* as a motor vehicle designed to carry more than 10 persons and *school bus* as a bus that carries students to or from school or school-related activities.

² For additional information, refer to Special Investigation Report—*Pupil Transportation in Vehicles Not Meeting Federal School Bus Standards* (NTSB/SIR-99/02).

³ *Specialty bus* is the industry term for the small buses that are commonly used as shuttle or tour buses. No Federal standard defines the names and configurations for buses of these sizes and types.

The Federal school bus crashworthiness standards have had an enormous impact on the safety of student transportation. According to a NHTSA fact sheet on school buses, the number of school bus passenger fatalities nationwide averages fewer than 10 each year out of approximately 10 billion student trips.⁴

NHTSA's Safety Program Guideline 17, *Pupil Transportation Safety*, establishes minimum recommendations for a State highway safety program for pupil transportation. Guideline 17 recommends that buses meeting the Federal structural standards for school buses be used for transporting children to and from school or school-related activities. A 1997 NHTSA interpretation letter states that because Head Start facilities are primarily involved with the education of preprimary school children, the buses used to transport children to and from the facilities "are considered school buses...and must meet all Federal school bus safety standards." A 1998 NHTSA interpretation letter regarding the use of buses transporting children between schools and publicly or privately owned day care centers states that if the bus is "used significantly"⁵ to transport children to or from school or a school-related event, the vehicle must meet the Federal school bus safety standards.

The States, which are responsible for enforcing the use of school buses, in most cases, require that children be transported to and from school only on buses meeting Federal school bus crashworthiness standards. Some States, however, by statutory exclusion or exception either allow or do not prohibit the use of nonconforming buses to school-related activities, including Head Start programs and day care facilities. The guidelines to the States and to the transportation industry from Federal agencies and national associations clearly state that vehicles built to school bus standards should be used for these activities.

For its special investigation report, the Safety Board reviewed a February 1999 survey conducted by the National Association of State Directors of Pupil Transportation Services (NASDPTS). Of the 32 directors responding, only 26 directors said that their States prohibit the use of nonconforming vans to transport children to and from school; 6 directors said that their States had no such prohibitions. Regarding the transport of children to and from school-related activities, 19 States prohibit the use of nonconforming vans, and 13 do not. Twenty States currently permit the use of nonconforming vans for Head Start transportation, while eight do not.⁶ Twenty-three States allow the use of vans in day care centers, and six do not.

NASDPTS states in a recent position paper, "We believe that it is appropriate to require higher levels of safety in vehicles that transport children to and from school and school-related activities." NASDPTS further states that "school children should be transported in school buses which provide them with the highest levels of safety, not in vans which do not meet the stringent school bus safety standards issued by the Federal Government."

⁴ The number of student trips was obtained from a January 1999 position paper of the National Association of State Directors of Pupil Transportation.

⁵ In the case that resulted in the letter of interpretation, the van was transporting students (not necessarily the same students) 5 days a week.

⁶ The total number of responses to some questions varies because some State directors did not answer all survey inquiries.

The Safety Board is disturbed by the trend toward using nonconforming vehicles rather than school buses in pupil transportation. When States and various school systems allow children to be transported in vehicles not meeting Federal school bus construction standards, they put children at greater risk of fatal or serious injury in the event of an accident. The Safety Board is firmly convinced that the best way to maximize pupil transportation safety is to require the use of school buses or buses built to equivalent occupant crash protection standards.

In February 1999, based on testing that it had conducted, NHTSA published *Guideline for the Safe Transportation of Pre-school Age Children in School Buses*, which recommends that preschool-age children be transported in child safety restraint systems. The Safety Board agrees that the use of child restraint systems can improve the survivability and lessen the chances of severe injury for students in small buses. All bus operators who transport preschool-aged children should therefore be made aware of and encouraged to comply with NHTSA's guideline.

The Safety Board recognizes that, although safety-conscious schools and organizations will increasingly replace nonconforming buses with school buses, vehicles not meeting the occupant crash protection standards of school buses will be used for pupil transport until laws stipulate otherwise. It is therefore particularly essential that operators of all vehicles equipped with occupant restraints ensure that students wear the age-appropriate restraint. In the three accidents mentioned earlier involving 15-passenger vans, had the passengers been wearing appropriate restraints, most of those who died probably would have survived and most of those who were injured probably would have sustained less severe injuries.

The Safety Board reviewed the current seat belt laws of several States and noted that some have allowable exclusions or exemptions pertaining to safety restraint use in buses for pupil transportation. These allowable exclusions and exemptions put students at great risk of fatal or serious injury in the event of an accident.

The Safety Board therefore recommends that the States, Territories, and the District of Columbia:

Require that all vehicles carrying more than 10 passengers (buses) and transporting children to and from school and school-related activities, including, but not limited to, Head Start programs and day care centers, meet the school bus structural standards or the equivalent as set forth in 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 571. Enact regulatory measures to enforce compliance with the revised statutes. (H-99-22)

Review your State and local laws and, if applicable, revise to eliminate any exclusions or exemptions pertaining to the use of age-appropriate restraints in all seat belt equipped vehicles carrying more than 10 passengers (buses) and transporting school children. (H-99-23)

Adopt the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration's *Guideline for the Safe Transportation of Pre-school Age Children in School Buses*, distribute the guideline to all school bus operators transporting preschool-age children to and

from school or school-related activities, and encourage those operators to implement the guideline. (H-99-24)

Also, the Safety Board issued Safety Recommendations to the Department of Health and Human Services, the National School Boards Association, the National Association of Independent Schools, the National Conference on School Transportation, the National Parent Teacher Association, the National Association of Child Care Professionals, the National Child Care Association, the National Head Start Association, the Young Men's Christian Association, the Young Women's Christian Association, the national headquarters of 14 major churches, and the Community Transportation Association of America.

The National Transportation Safety Board is an independent Federal agency with the statutory responsibility "to promote transportation safety by conducting independent accident investigations and by formulating safety improvement recommendations" (Public Law 93-633). The Safety Board is vitally interested in any action taken as a result of its safety recommendations. Therefore, it would appreciate a response from you within 90 days regarding action taken or contemplated with respect to the recommendations in this letter. Please refer to Safety Recommendations H-99-22 through -24 in your reply. If you need additional information, you may call (202) 314-6444.

Chairman HALL, Vice Chairman FRANCIS, and Members HAMMERSCHMIDT, GOGLIA, and BLACK concurred in these recommendations.

[original signed]

By: Jim Hall
Chairman